R647. Natural Resources; Oil, Gas and Mining; Non-Coal.

R647-1. Minerals Regulatory Program.

R647-1-106. Definitions.

"Act" means the Utah Mined Land Reclamation Act, enacted in 1975, as amended. (Section 40-8-1, et seq., UCA).

"Adjudicative proceeding" means an agency action or proceeding that determines the legal rights, duties, privileges, immunities, or other legal interests of one or more identifiable persons, including all agency actions to grant, deny, revoke, suspend, modify, annul, withdraw, or amend an authority, right, or license; and judicial review of all of such actions. Those matters not governed by Title 63, Chapter 46b, Administrative Procedures Act, of the Utah Code annotated (1953, as amended) shall not be included within this definition.

"Agency" means a board, commission, department, division, officer, council, office, committee, commission, bureau, or other administrative unit of this state, including the agency head, agency employees, or other persons acting on behalf of or under the authority of the agency head, but does not mean the Legislature, the courts, the governor, any political subdivision of the state, or any administrative unit of a political subdivision of the state.

"Agency head" means an individual or body of individuals in whom the ultimate legal authority of the agency is vested by statute.

"Amendment" is an insignificant change in the approved notice of intention.

"Approved Notice of Intention" means a formally filed notice of intention to commence mining operations, including any amendments or revisions thereto, which has been approved by the Division. An approved notice of intention is not required for exploration having a disturbed area of five or less surface acres, or for small mining operations.

"Board" means the Utah Board of Oil, Gas and Mining. The Board shall hear all appeals of adjudicative proceedings which commenced before the Division as well as all adjudicative proceedings and other proceedings which commence before the Board. The Board may appoint a Hearing Examiner for its hearings in accordance with the Rules of Practice and Procedure before the Board of Oil, Gas and Mining.

"Deleterious Materials" means earth, waste or introduced materials exposed by mining operations to air, water, weather or microbiological processes, which would likely produce chemical or physical conditions in the soils or water that are detrimental to the biota or hydrologic systems.

"Deposit" or "mineral deposit" means an accumulation of mineral matter in the form of consolidated rock, unconsolidated materials, solutions, or otherwise occurring on the surface, beneath the surface, or in the waters of the land from which any useful product may be produced, extracted or obtained, or which is extracted by underground mining methods for underground storage. "Deposit" or "mineral deposit" excludes sand, gravel, rock aggregate, water, geothermal steam, and oil and gas, but includes oil shale and bituminous sands extracted by mining operations.

"Development" means the work performed in relation to a deposit following its discovery, but prior to and in contemplation of production mining operations. Development includes, but is not limited to, preparing the site for mining operations; further defining the ore deposit by drilling or other means; conducting pilot plant operations; and constructing roads or ancillary facilities.

"Disturbed Area" means the surface land disturbed by mining operations. The disturbed area for small mining operations shall not exceed five acres. The disturbed area for large mining operations shall not exceed the acreage described in the approved notice of intention.

"Division" means the Utah Division of Oil, Gas and Mining. The Division Director or designee is the Presiding Officer for all informal adjudicative proceedings which commence before the Division in accordance with Rule R647-5.

"Exempt Mining Operations" means those mining operations which were previously exempt from the Act because less than 500 tons of material was mined in a period of twelve consecutive months or less than two acres of land was excavated or used as a disposal site in a period of twelve consecutive months. These exemptions were eliminated by statutory amendments in 1986 and are no longer available.

"Exploration" means surface disturbing activities conducted for the purpose of discovering a deposit or mineral deposit, delineating the boundaries of a deposit or mineral deposit, and identifying regions or specific areas in which deposits or mineral deposits are most likely to exist. "Exploration" includes, but is not limited to: sinking shafts; tunneling; drilling holes; digging pits or cuts; building roads and other access ways.

"Gravel" means a naturally occurring unconsolidated to moderately consolidated accumulation of rock and mineral particles, the dominant size range being between 2mm and 10mm, which has been deposited by sedimentary processes.

"Land affected" means the surface and subsurface of an area within the state where mining operations are being or will be conducted, including, but not limited to: (a) on-site private ways, roads, and railroads; (b) land excavations; (c) exploration sites; (d) drill sites or workings; (e) refuse banks or spoil piles; (f) evaporation or settling ponds; (g) stockpiles; (h) leaching dumps; (i) placer areas; (j) tailings ponds or dumps; (k) work, parking, storage, or waste discharge areas, structures, and facilities. Land affected does not include: (x) lands which have been reclaimed in accordance with an approved plan or as otherwise approved by the Board, (y) lands on which mining operations ceased prior to July 1, 1977, or (z) lands on which previously exempt mining operations ceased prior to April 29, 1989.

"Large Mining Operations" means mining operations which have a disturbed area of more than five surface acres at any time.

"License" means a franchise, permit, certification, approval, registration, charter, or similar form of authorization required by statute.

"Mining operations" means those activities conducted on the surface of the land for the exploration for, development of, or extraction of a mineral deposit, including, but not limited to, surface mining and the surface effects of underground and in situ mining; on-site transportation, concentrating, milling, evaporation, and other primary processing. "Mining operation" does not include: the extraction of sand, gravel, and rock aggregate; the extraction of oil and gas; the extraction of geothermal steam; smelting or refining operations; off-site operations and transportation; or reconnaissance activities which will not cause significant surface resource disturbance and do not involve the use of mechanized earth-moving equipment such as bulldozers or backhoes.

"Notice of Intention" means a notice of intention to commence mining operations, including any amendments or revisions thereto.

"Off-site" means the land areas that are outside of or beyond the on-site land.

"On-site" means the surface lands on or under which surface or underground mining operations are conducted. A series of related properties under the control of a single operator but separated by small parcels of land controlled by others will be considered a single site unless excepted by the Division.

"Operator" means any natural person, corporation, association, partnership, receiver, trustee, executor, administrator, guardian, fiduciary, agent, or other organization or representative of any kind, either public or private, owning, controlling, conducting, or managing a mining operation or proposed mining operation.

"Owner" means any natural person, corporation, association, partnership, receiver, trustee, executor, administrator, guardian, fiduciary, agent, or other organization or representative of any kind, either public or private, owning, controlling, conducting, or managing a mineral deposit or the surface of lands employed in mining operations.

"Party" means the Board, Division or other person commencing an adjudicative proceeding, all respondents, all persons permitted by the Board to intervene in the proceeding, and all persons authorized by statute or agency rule to participate as parties in an adjudicative proceeding.

"Permit" means a notice to conduct mining operations issued by the Division. A notice to conduct mining operations is issued by the Division when either a notice of intention for a small mining operation or exploration is determined to be complete and includes a surety approved by the Division, or a notice of intention for a large mining operation or exploration with a plan of operations and surety approved by the Division.

"Person" means an individual, group of individuals, partnership, corporation, association, political subdivision or its units, governmental subdivision or its units, public or private organization or entity of any character, or another agency.

"Presiding Officer" means an agency head, or an individual or body of individuals designated by the agency head, by the agency's rules, or by statute to conduct an adjudicative proceeding. For the purpose of these rules, the Board, or its appointed Hearing Examiner, shall be considered the Presiding Officer of all appeals of informal adjudicative proceedings which commenced before the

Division as well as all adjudicative proceedings which commence before the Board. The Division Director or his/her designee shall be considered a Presiding Officer for all informal adjudicative proceedings which commence before the Division in accordance with this Rule R647-5. If fairness to the parties is not compromised, an agency may substitute one Presiding Officer for another during any proceeding.

"Reclamation" means actions performed during or after mining operations to shape, stabilize, revegetate, or otherwise treat the land affected in order to achieve a safe and ecologically stable condition and use which will be consistent with local environmental conditions and land management practices.

"Regrade or Grade" means to physically alter the topography of any land surface.

"Respondent" means any person against whom an adjudicative proceeding is initiated, whether by an agency or any other person.

"Revision" means a change to an approved Notice of Intention to Conduct Mining Operations, which will increase or decrease the amount of land affected, or alter the location and type of on-site surface facilities, such that the nature of the reclamation plan will differ substantially from that in the approved Notice of Intention.

"Rock Aggregate" means those consolidated rock materials associated with a sand deposit, a gravel deposit, or a sand and gravel deposit, that were created by alluvial sedimentary processes. The definition of rock aggregate specifically excludes any solid rock in the form of bedrock which is exposed at the surface of the earth or overlain by unconsolidated material.

"Sand" means a naturally occurring unconsolidated to moderately consolidated accumulation of rock and mineral particles, the dominant size range being between 1/16mm to 2mm, which has been deposited by sedimentary processes.

"Small Mining Operations" means mining operations which have a disturbed area of five or less surface acres at any time.

"Surface Mining" means mining conducted on the surface of the land including open pit, strip, or auger mining; dredging; quarrying; leaching; surface evaporation operations; reworking abandoned dumps and tailings and activities related thereto.

"Underground Mining" means mining carried out beneath the surface by means of shafts, tunnels or other underground mine openings.

KEY: minerals reclamation 2004 Notice of Continuation July 8, 2003 40-8-1 et seq. R647. Natural Resources; Oil, Gas and Mining; Non-Coal. R647-6. Inspection and Enforcement: Division Authority and Procedures. R647-6-101. General Information on Authority and Procedures.

- (1) Enforcement Authority. Nothing in the Utah Mined Land Reclamation Act will be construed as eliminating any additional enforcement rights or procedures which are available under State law to the Division, but which are not specifically enumerated in Sections 40-8-8, 40-8-9 and 40-8-9.1 of the Utah Mined Land Reclamation Act.
- (2) Inspection Program. The Division will conduct inspections of each mining operation and reclamation under its jurisdiction for the purpose of enforcing the provisions of Title 40, Chapter 8.
- 2.11. Division representatives shall be allowed to enter upon and through any minerals mining operation and reclamation without advance notice. Division Representatives need to check in on site or make an attempt to contact the permittee or operator, if available, prior to proceeding through the site.
- 2.12. Division representatives shall be allowed to inspect any monitoring equipment or method of exploration, operation or reclamation and have access to and may copy any records required under the Utah Mined Land Reclamation Act.
- (3) Compliance Conference.
- 3.11. A permittee or operator may request an on-site compliance conference with an authorized representative of the Division to review the compliance status of any condition or practice at any mining operation and reclamation. Any such conference will not constitute an inspection within the meaning of Section 40-8-9 and R647-6-101.2.
- 3.12. The Division may accept or refuse any request to conduct a compliance conference under R647-6-101.3.11. A conference will be considered an inspection if a condition or practice exists which is described in R647-6-102.1.11.111 or 1.11.112.
- 3.13. The authorized representative at any compliance conference will review such conditions and practices in order to advise whether any such condition or practice is, or may become a violation of any requirement of the Utah Mined Land Reclamation Act or any applicable permit or exploration approval.
- 3.14. Neither the holding of a compliance conference under this section nor any statement given by the authorized representative at such a conference will affect:
- 3.14.111. Any rights or obligations of the Division or of the permittee or operator with respect to any inspection, notice of violation or cessation order, whether prior or subsequent to such compliance conference; or

3.14.112. The validity of any notice of violation or cessation order issued with respect to any condition or practice reviewed at the compliance conference.

#### R647-6-102. Provisions of State Enforcement.

- 1. Cessation Orders.
- 1.11. The Division will immediately order a cessation of mining operations and reclamation or of the relevant portion thereof, if it finds, on the basis of any Division inspection, any violation of the Utah Mined Land Reclamation Act, or any condition of a permit under the Utah Mined Land Reclamation Act, which:
- 1.11.111. Creates an imminent danger to the health or safety of the public; or
- 1.11.112. Is causing or can reasonably be expected to cause significant, imminent environmental harm to land, air, or water resources.
- 1.12. Mining operations and reclamation conducted by any person without a valid permit constitute a condition or practice described in R647-6-102.1.111 or 1.11.112.
- 1.13. If the cessation ordered under R647-6-102.1.11 will not completely abate the conditions described in R647-6-102.1.11.111 or 1.11.112 in the most expeditious manner physically possible, the Division will impose affirmative obligations on the permittee or operator to abate the violation. The order will specify the time by which abatement will be accomplished.
- 1.14. When a notice of violation has been issued under R647-6-102.2 and the permittee or operator fails to abate the violation within the abatement period fixed or subsequently extended by the Division then the Division will immediately order a cessation of mining operations and reclamation, or of the portion relevant to the violation. A cessation order issued under R647-6-102.1.14 will require the permittee or operator to take all steps the Division deems necessary to abate the violations covered by the order in the most expeditious manner physically possible.
- 1.15. A cessation order issued under R647-6-102.1.11 or R647-6-102.1.14 will be in writing, signed by the authorized representative of the Division who issued it, and will set forth with reasonable specificity:
- 1.15.111. The nature of the violation;
- 1.15.112. The remedial action or affirmative obligation required, if any, including interim steps, if appropriate;
- 1.15.113. The time established for abatement, if appropriate, including the time for meeting any interim steps;
- 1.15.114. A reasonable description of the portion of the mining operation and reclamation to which it applies; and

- 1.15.115. That the order will remain in effect until the violation has been abated or until vacated, modified or terminated in writing by the Division.
- 1.16. Reclamation and other activities intended to protect public health and safety and the environment will continue during the period of any order unless otherwise provided.
- 1.17. The Division may modify, terminate or vacate a cessation order for good cause and may extend the time for abatement if the failure to abate within the time previously set was not caused by lack of diligence on the part of the permittee or operator.
- 1.18. The Division will terminate a cessation order by written notice to the permittee or operator, when it is determined that all conditions, practices or violations listed in the order have been abated. Termination will not affect the right of the Division to assess civil penalties for those violations under R647-7.
- 2. Notices of Violation.
- 2.11. When on the basis of any Division inspection the Division determines that there exists a violation of the Utah Mined Land Reclamation Act or any condition of a permit required by the Utah Mined Land Reclamation Act, which does not create an imminent danger or harm for which a cessation order must be issued under R647-6-102.1, the Division will issue a notice of violation to the permittee or operator fixing a reasonable time not to exceed 90 days for the abatement of the violation and providing opportunity for a conference before the Division.
- 2.12. A notice of violation issued under R647-6-102.2 will be in writing, signed by the authorized representative of the Division, and will set forth with reasonable specificity:
- 2.12.111. The nature of the violation;
- 2.12.112. The remedial action required, which may include interim steps;
- 2.12.113. A reasonable time for abatement, which may include time for accomplishment of interim steps; and
- 2.12.114. A reasonable description of the portion of the mining operation or reclamation to which it applies.
- 2.13. The Division may extend the time set for abatement or for accomplishment of an interim step, if the failure to meet the time previously set was not caused by lack of diligence on the part of the permittee or operator. The total time for abatement under a notice of violation, including all extensions, will not exceed 90 days from the date of issuance except upon a showing by the permittee or operator that it is not feasible to abate the violation within 90 calendar days due to one or more of the circumstances in R647-6-102.2.16. An extended abatement date pursuant to this section will not be granted when the permittee or operator's failure to abate within 90 days has

been caused by lack of diligence or intentional delay by the permittee or operator in completing the remedial action required.

- 2.14. If the permittee or operator fails to meet any time set for abatement or for accomplishment of an interim step, the Division will issue a cessation order under R647-6-102.1.14.
- 2.15. The Division will terminate a notice of violation by written notice to the permittee or operator, when the Division determines that all violations listed in the notice of violation have been abated. Termination will not affect the right of the Division to assess civil penalties for those violations which have been abated, nor will termination affect the right of the Division to assess civil penalties for those violations under R647-7.
- 2.16. Circumstances which may qualify a mining operation and reclamation for an abatement period of more than 90 days are:
- 2.16.111. Where good cause is shown by the permittee or operator;
- 2.16.112. Where climatic conditions preclude complete abatement within 90 days;
- 2.16.113. Where due to climatic conditions, abatement within 90 days would clearly cause more environmental harm than it would prevent; or
- 2.16.114. Where the permittee's or operator's action to abate the violation within 90 days would violate safety standards established by the Mine Safety and Health Act of 1977.
- 2.17. Other requirements on abatement times extended beyond 90 days.
- 2.17.111. Whenever an abatement time in excess of 90 days is permitted, interim abatement measures will be imposed to the extent necessary to minimize harm to the public or the environment.
- 2.17.112. The permittee or operator will have the burden of establishing by clear and convincing proof that he or she is entitled to an extension under R647-6-102.2.16 and R647-6-102.2.17.
- 2.17.113. Any determination made under R647-6-102.2.13 will contain a right of appeal pursuant to R647-5.
- 3. Service of Notices of Violation, Cessation Orders and Show Cause Orders.
- 3.11. A notice of violation, cessation order, or order to show cause will be served on the permittee or operator promptly after issuance by one of the following methods:
- 3.11.111. Personal service, in accordance with the Utah Rules of Civil Procedure. Service shall be effective on the date of personal service.

- 3.11.112. Delivery by United States mail or by courier service, provided the person being served signs a document indicating receipt. Service shall be complete on the date the receipt is signed.
- 3.11.113. First posting a copy of the notice at a conspicuous location at the mine site or offices of the place of violation, and thereafter by personally delivering or mailing a copy by certified mail to the permittee or operator at the last address provided to the Division. Service shall be complete upon personal delivery or three days after the date of mailing.
- 3.12. Service on the permittee or operator shall be sufficient if service is made upon:
- 3.12.111. An officer of a corporation,
- 3.12.112. The person designated by law for service of process, or the registered agent for the corporation,
- 3.12.113. An owner, or partner of an entity other than a corporation, or
- 3.12.114. A person designated in writing by the permittee or operator as a person authorized to receive notice from the Division for matters pertaining to the mining operation and reclamation.
- 3.13. Proof of Service.
- 3.13.111. Proof of personal service shall be made in accordance with the provisions of the Utah Rules of Civil Procedure,
- 3.13.112. Proof of service by certified mail or courier shall be made by obtaining a copy of the receipt signed by the recipient.
- 3.13.113. Proof of posting, or personal delivery may be made by a signed written statement of the person effecting posting, or personal delivery stating the date, time, and place of posting. In addition, if personal delivery, the person to whom the notice was delivered.
- 4. Stop Work Conference.
- 4.11. Except as provided in R647-6-102.4.12 a notice of violation or cessation order which requires cessation of mining, will expire within 30 days after it is served unless a Stop Work Conference, under the rules of informal process (R645-5), has been held within that time. The Stop Work Conference will be held within 5 days of request, at or reasonably close to the mine site so that the site may be viewed during the conference or at any other location acceptable to the Division and the permittee or operator. The Division office nearest to the mine site will be deemed to be reasonably close to the mine site unless a closer location is requested and agreed to by the Division and permittee or operator. Expiration of a notice or order will not affect the Division's right to assess civil penalties for the violations mentioned in the notice or order under R647-7.

- 4.12. A notice of violation or cessation order will not expire as provided in R647-6-4.11, if the condition, practice or violation in question has been abated or if the Stop Work Conference has been waived, or if, with the consent of the permittee or operator, the conference is held upon agreement later than 30 days after the notice or order was served. For purposes of R647-6-4.12:
- 4.12.111. The conference will be deemed waived if the permittee or operator:
- 4.12.111.A. Is informed, by written notice served in the manner provided in R647-6-102.3, that he or she will be deemed to have waived a conference unless he or she requests one within 30 days after service of the notice; and
- 4.12.111.B. Fails to request a conference within that time;
- 4.12.112. The written notice referred to in R647-6-4.12.111.A., will be served no later than five days after the notice or order is served on the permittee or operator; and
- 4.12.113. The permittee or operator will be deemed to have consented to an extension of the time for holding the conference if his or her request is received on or after the 21st day after service of the notice or order. The extension of time will be equal to the number of days elapsed after the 21st day.
- 4.13. The Division will give as much advance notice as is practicable of the time, place, and subject matter of the Stop Work Conference to the permittee or operator.
- 4.14. The Division will also post notice of the conference at the Division office closest to the mine site.
- 4.15. A Stop Work Conference will be conducted by a representative of the Division who may accept oral or written arguments and any other relevant information from any person attending.
- 4.16. Within five days after the close of the conference, the Division will affirm, modify or vacate the notice or order in writing. The decision will be sent to the permittee or operator.
- 4.17. The granting or waiver of a conference will not affect the right of any person to have a conference in R647-7-106 or to have a formal review under Subsection 40-8-9(5). No evidence as to statements made or evidence produced at a Stop Work Conference will be introduced as evidence or to impeach a witness at formal review proceedings of that matter before the Board.
- 4.17.111. Any order or decision issued by the Division as a result of a conference as provided for under Subsection 40-8-9(5) and R647-6-102 including an order upholding the cessation order shall be a modification of the cessation order.
- 5. Inability to Comply.
- 5.11. No cessation order or notice of violation issued under R647-6 may be vacated because of inability to comply.

5.12. Unless caused by lack of diligence, inability to comply may be considered only in mitigation of the amount of civil penalty under R647-7 and of the duration of the suspension of a permit under R647-6.

**KEY:** minerals reclamation

2004

40-8-1 et seq.

R647. Natural Resources; Oil, Gas and Mining; Non-Coal. R647-7. Inspection and Enforcement: Civil Penalties. R647-7-101. Information on Civil Penalties.

- 1. Objectives. Civil penalties are assessed under Section 40-8-9.1 of the Utah Mined Land Reclamation Act and R647-7 to deter violations and to ensure maximum compliance with the terms and purposes of the Utah Mined Land Reclamation Act on the part of the minerals mining industry.
- 2. How Assessments Are Made. The Division will appoint an assessment officer to review each notice of violation and cessation order in accordance with the assessment procedures described in R647-7 to determine whether a civil penalty will be assessed and the amount of the penalty.

## R647-7-102. Penalty To Be Assessed.

- 1. The assessment officer will assess a penalty for each cessation order.
- 2. The assessment officer may assess a penalty for each notice of violation under the point system described in R647-7-103. In determining whether to assess a penalty, the assessment officer will consider the factors listed in R647-7-103.
- 3. Within 15 days of service of a notice of violation or cessation order, the permittee or operator may submit written information about the violation to the assessment officer at the Division offices. The assessment officer will consider any information so submitted in determining the facts surrounding the violation and the amount of the penalty.

### **R647-7-103.** Point System for Penalties.

- 1. Amount of Penalty. In determining the amount of the penalty, if any, to be assessed, consideration will be given to:
- 1.11. The permittee or operator's history of previous violations at the particular mining operation and reclamation, regardless of whether any led to a civil penalty assessment. However, a violation will not be considered if the notice or order containing the violation meets the conditions described in R647-7-103.2.11.111 or R647-7-103.2.11.112.
- 1.12. The seriousness of the violation based on the likelihood and extent of the potential or actual impact on the public or environment, both within and outside the permit area.
- 1.13. The degree of fault of the permittee or operator in causing or failing to correct the violation, either through act or omission. Such degree will range from inadvertent action causing an event which was unavoidable by the exercise of reasonable care to reckless, knowing or intentional conduct.

- 1.14. The permittee or operator's demonstrated good faith, by considering whether he took extraordinary measures to abate the violation in the shortest possible time, or merely abated the violation within the time given for abatement.
- 1.15. Consideration will also be given to whether the permittee or operator gained any economic benefit as a result of a failure to comply.
- 2. Assessment of Points.
- 2.11. History of Previous Violations. The assessment officer will assign up to 25 points based on the history of previous violations. One point will be assigned for each past violation contained in a notice of violation. Five points may be assigned for each violation contained in a cessation order. The history of previous violations, for the purpose of assigning points, will be determined and the points assigned with respect to the particular mining operation and reclamation. Points will be assigned as follows:
- 2.11.111. A violation will not be counted, if the notice or order is the subject of pending administrative or judicial review, or if the time to request such review, or to appeal any administrative or judicial decision has not expired, and thereafter, it will be counted for only three years;
- 2.11.112. No violation for which the notice or order has been vacated will be counted; and
- 2.11.113. Each violation will be counted without regard to whether it led to a civil penalty assessment.
- 2.12. Seriousness. The assessment officer will assign up to 45 points based on the seriousness of the violation as follows:
- 2.12.111. Probability of occurrence. The assessment officer will assign up to 20 points based on the probability of the occurrence of the event which a violated standard is designed to prevent. Points will be assessed according to the following table:

TABLE 1

OCCURRENCE	POI NTS	
None	0	
I nsi gni fi cant	1 - 4	
UnI i kel y	5 - 9	
Li kel y	10 - 19	
Occurred	20	

2.12.112. Extent of potential or actual damage. The assessment officer will assign up to 25 points, based on the extent of the potential or actual damage to the public health and safety or the environment, in terms of duration, area and impact of such damage.

2.12.113. Alternative to R647-7-103.2.12.111 and R647-7-103.2.12.112, in the case of a violation of an administrative requirement, such as a requirement to keep records, the assessment officer will, in lieu of R647-7-103.2.12.111 and R647-7-103.2.12.112, assign up to 25 points for seriousness, based upon the extent to which enforcement is hindered by the violation.

# 2.13. Degree of Fault.

- 2.13.111. The assessment officer will assign up to 30 points based on the degree of fault of the permittee or operator in causing or failing to correct the violation, condition, or practice which led to the notice or order, either through act or omission. Points will be assessed as follows:
- 2.13.111.A. A violation which occurs through no fault of the permittee or operator, or by inadvertence which was unavoidable by the exercise of reasonable care, will be assigned no penalty points for degree of fault;
- 2.13.111.B. A violation which is caused by fault of the operator will be assigned 15 points or less, depending on the degree of fault. Fault means the failure of a permittee or operator to prevent the occurrence of any violation of his or her permit or any requirement of the Utah Mined Land Reclamation Act due to indifference, lack of diligence, or lack of reasonable care, or the failure to abate any violation of such permit or the Utah Mined Land Reclamation Act due to indifference, lack of diligence, or lack of reasonable care; and
- 2.13.111.C. A violation which occurs through a greater degree of fault, meaning reckless, knowing or intentional conduct will be assigned 16 to 30 points, depending on the degree of fault.
- 2.13.112. In calculating points to be assigned for degree of fault, the acts of all persons working at the mining operations on the mine site will be attributed to the permittee or operator, unless that permittee or operator establishes that they were acts of deliberate sabotage or acts of a third-party otherwise authorized to occupy the same lands.
- 2.14. Good Faith in Attempting to Achieve Compliance. The assessment officer will subtract points based on the degree of good faith of the permittee or operator. Points will be assigned as follows:
- 2.14.111. Easy Abatement Situation. An easy abatement situation is one in which the operator has on-site the resources necessary to achieve compliance of the violated standard within the permit area.

#### TABLE 2

DEGREE OF GOOD FAITH	POI NTS	
Immediate Compliance Rapid Compliance Normal Compliance	-11 to -20 - 1 to -10	

2.14.112. Difficult Abatement Situation. A difficult abatement situation is one which requires submission of plans prior to physical activity to achieve compliance, or the permittee or operator does not have the resources at hand to achieve compliance of the violated standard.

TABLE 3

DEGREE OF GOOD FAITH	POI NTS	
Rapid Compliance	-11 to -20	
Normal Compliance	- 1 to -10	
Extended Compliance	0	

- 2.15. Definition of Compliance.
- 2.15.111. Immediate Compliance requires evidence that the violation has been abated immediately (which is a question of fact) following issuance of the notice of violation.
- 2.15.112. Rapid Compliance requires evidence that the permittee or operator used diligence to abate the violation.
- 2.15.113. Normal Compliance means that the operator complied within the abatement period required under the notice of violation or by the violated standards.
- 2.15.114. Extended Compliance means that the permittee or operator took minimal actions for abatement to stay within the limits of the notice of violation or the violated standard; or that the plan submitted for abatement was incomplete.
- 2.16. The Effect on the permittee or operator's Ability to Continue in Business. Initially, it will be presumed that the permittee or operator's ability to continue in business will not be affected by the order of assessment. The permittee or operator may submit to the assessment officer information concerning the operator's financial status to show that payment of the civil penalty will affect the permittee or operator's ability to continue in business. A reduction of the penalty, work in kind, or a special payment plan may be ordered if the information provided by the permittee or operator demonstrates that the civil penalty will substantially reduce the likelihood of the permittee or operator's ability to continue in business.
- 3. Determination of Amount of Penalty. The assessment officer will determine the amount of any civil penalty converting the total number of points assigned under R647-7-103.3 to a dollar amount, according to the following table:

TABLE 4

Poi nts	Dol I ars	Poi nts	Dol I ars
1	22	6	132
2	44	7	154
3	66	8	176
4	88	9	198
5	110	10	220

11 12 13 14 15 16 17 18 19 20 21 22 23 24 25 26 27 28 29 30 31 32 33 34 35 36 37	242 264 286 308 330 352 374 396 418 440 462 484 506 528 550 660 770 880 990 1, 100 1, 210 1, 320 1, 430 1, 540 1, 650 1, 760 1, 870	39 40 41 42 43 44 45 46 47 48 49 50 51 52 53 54 55 56 57 58 59 60 61 62 63 64 65	2, 090 2, 200 2, 310 2, 420 2, 530 2, 640 2, 750 2, 860 2, 970 3, 190 3, 190 3, 300 3, 410 3, 520 3, 630 3, 740 3, 850 4, 070 4, 180 4, 290 4, 400 4, 510 4, 620 4, 730 4, 840 4, 950
37 38	1, 870 1, 980	65	4, 950

- 4. Whenever a violation contained in a cessation order has not been abated, a civil penalty of not less than \$750.00 will be assessed for each day during which such failure continues, except that, if the permittee or operator initiates review proceedings with respect to the violation, the abatement period will be extended as follows:
- 4.11. If suspension of the abatement requirements of the notice or order is ordered in a temporary relief proceeding under the Utah Mined Land Reclamation Act, after determination that the permittee or operator will suffer irreparable loss or damage from the application of the requirements, the extended period permitted for abatement will not end until the date specified in the Board final order; and a penalty will not be assessed until the time allowed for abatement by the order has expired.
- 4.12. If the permittee or operator initiates review proceedings under the Utah Mined Land Reclamation Act with respect to the violation, in which the obligations to abate are suspended by the court pursuant to the Utah Mined Land Reclamation Act, the extended period permitted for abatement will not end until the date specified in the court final order; and a penalty will not be assessed until the time allowed for abatement by the order has expired.

### R647-7-104. Waiver of Use of Formula to Determine Civil Penalty.

1. The assessment officer upon his or her own initiative or upon written request received by the Division within 15 days of receipt of a notice of violation or a cessation order, may waive the use of the formula contained in R647-7-103 to set the civil penalty, if they determine that, taking into account exceptional factors present in the particular case, the penalty is demonstrably unjust.

### R647-7-105. Procedures for Assessment of Civil Penalties - Proposed Assessment.

- 1. The assessment officer will serve a copy of the proposed assessment and of the worksheet showing the computation of the proposed assessment on the permittee or operator, by certified mail, within 30 days of the issuance of the notice or order.
- 1.11. If the mail is tendered at the address of the permittee or operator set forth in the permit application or at any address at which that permittee or operator is in fact located, and he or she refuses to accept delivery of or to collect such mail, the requirements of R647-7-105.1 will be deemed to have been complied with upon such tender.
- 1.12. Failure by the Division to serve any proposed assessment within 30 days will not be grounds for dismissal of all or any part of such assessment unless the permittee or operator:
- 1.12.111. Proves actual prejudice as a result of the delay; and
- 1.12.112. Makes a timely objection to the delay.
- 2. Unless a conference has been requested, the assessment officer will review and reassess any penalty if necessary to consider facts which were not reasonably available on the date of issuance of the proposed assessment. The assessment officer will serve a copy of any such reassessment and of the worksheet showing the computation of the reassessment in the manner provided in R647-7-105.1, within 30 days after the date the violation is abated.

#### **R647-7-106.** Procedures for Informal Conference.

- 1. The Division will arrange for a conference to review the fact of the violation and/or the proposed assessment or reassessment, upon written request of the permittee or operator, if the request is received within 30 days from the date the proposed assessment or reassessment is received by the permittee or operator.
- 2. Informal Conference Scheduling and Findings.
- 2.11. The Division will assign a conference officer to hold conferences. The conference will be informal. The conference will be held within 60 days from the date of issuance of the proposed assessment or the end of the abatement period, whichever is later. PROVIDED: That a failure by the Division to hold such a conference within 60 days will not be grounds for dismissal of all or part of an assessment unless the permittee or operator proves actual prejudice as a result of the delay.

- 2.12. The Division will provide notice of the time and place of the conference to the operator or permittee and post notice of the conference at the main Division office at least five days before the conference. Any person may attend the conference.
- 2.13. The conference officer will consider all relevant information on the violation. Within 30 days after the conference is held, the conference officer will either:
- 2.13.111. Settle the issues, in which case a settlement agreement will be prepared and signed by the conference officer on behalf of the Division and by the permittee or operator;
- 2.13.112. Affirm, raise, lower, or vacate the penalty; or
- 2.13.113. Affirm, deny, modify or vacate the violation.
- 3. The conference officer will promptly serve the permittee or operator with a notice of his or her action in the manner provided in R647-7-105.1, and will include a worksheet if the penalty has been raised or lowered. The reasons for the conference officer's action will be fully documented in the file.
- 4. Informal Conference Settlement Agreement.
- 4.11. If a settlement agreement is entered into, the permittee or operator will be deemed to have waived all rights to further review of the violation or penalty in question, except as otherwise expressly provided for in the settlement agreement. The settlement agreement will contain a clause to this effect.
- 4.12. If full payment of the amount specified in the settlement agreement is not received by the Division within 30 days after the date of signing, the Division may enforce the agreement or rescind it and proceed according to R647-7-106.2.13.112 within 30 days from the date of the rescission.
- 5. The conference officer may terminate the conference when he or she determines that the issues cannot be resolved or that the permittee or operator is not diligently working toward resolution of the issues.
- 6. At formal review proceedings of the matter before the Board, no evidence as to statements made or evidence produced by one party at a conference will be introduced as evidence by another party or to impeach a witness.

#### **R647-7-107.** Requests for Formal Hearing.

1. A permittee or operator charged with a violation may contest the proposed penalty or the fact of the violation by submitting: (a) a petition to the Board; and (b) an amount equal to the proposed penalty (or, if a conference has been held, the reassessed or affirmed penalty) to the Division (to be held in escrow as provided in R647-7-107.2) within 30 days of receipt of the proposed

assessment or reassessment, or 30 days from the date of service of the conference officer's action, whichever is later, but in every case, the penalty must be escrowed prior to commencement of the formal hearing.

- 2. The Division will transfer all funds submitted under R647-7-107.1 to an escrow account pending completion of the administrative and judicial review process, at which time it will disburse them as provided in R647-7-108.2 or R647-7-108.3.
- 3. Formal review of the violation fact or penalty will be conducted by the Board under the provisions of R641, rules of practice and procedure before the Board.

# R647-7-108. Final Assessment and Payment of Penalty.

- 1. If the permittee or operator fails to request a hearing as provided in R647-7-107, the proposed assessment or reassessment will become a final order of the Division and the penalty assessed will become due and payable upon expiration of the time allowed to request a hearing and upon the Division fulfilling its responsibilities under Subsection 40-8-9.1(3)(e).
- 2. If any party requests judicial review of a final order of the Board, the proposed penalty will be held in escrow until completion of the review. Otherwise, subject to R647-7-108.3, the escrowed funds will be transferred to the Division in payment of the penalty, and the escrow will end.
- 3. If the final decision of the administrative and judicial review results in an order reducing or eliminating the proposed penalty assessed under R647-7, the Division will within 30 days of receipt of the order refund to the permittee or operator all or part of the escrowed amount and interest accumulated, if any.
- 4. If the review results in an order increasing the penalty, the permittee or operator will pay the difference to the Division within 15 days after the order is received by such permittee or operator.

**KEY:** minerals reclamation 2004

40-8-1 et seq.

**R647.** Natural Resources; Oil, Gas and Mining; Non-Coal.

R647-8. Inspection and Enforcement: Individual Civil Penalties.

**R647-8-101.** Information on Individual Civil Penalties.

- 1. The rules in R647-8 provide guidance to exercise the authority set forth in Subsection 40-8-9.1(6).
- 2. Individual civil penalties will be assessed by a Division-appointed assessment officer using the process described in R647-8.

# R647-8-102. When an Individual Civil Penalty May Be Assessed.

- 1. Except as provided in R647-8-102.2, the assessment officer may assess an individual civil penalty against any corporate director, officer, or agent of a permittee or operator, or any other person who may be liable under Section 40-8-9.1 who knowingly and willfully authorized, ordered or carried out a violation, failure, or refusal.
- 2. The assessment officer will not assess an individual civil penalty in situations resulting from a permit violation by a corporate permittee or operator until a cessation order has been issued by the Division to the corporate permittee or operator for the violation, and the cessation order has remained unabated for 30 days.

# **R647-8-103.** Amount of the Individual Civil Penalty.

- 1. In determining the amount of an individual civil penalty assessed under R647-8-102, the assessment officer will consider the criteria specified in Section 40-8-9.1, including:
- 1.11. The individual's history of authorizing, ordering or carrying out previous violations, failures or refusals at the particular mining operation and reclamation;
- 1.12. The seriousness of the violation failure or refusal (as indicated by the extent of damage and/or the cost of reclamation), including any irreparable harm to the environment and any hazard to the health or safety of the public; and
- 1.13. The demonstrated good faith of the individual charged in attempting to achieve rapid compliance after notice of the violation, failure, or refusal.
- 2. The individual civil penalty will not exceed \$5,000 for each violation. Each day of continuing violation may be deemed a separate violation and the assessment officer may assess a separate individual civil penalty for each day the violation, failure or refusal continues, from the date of service of the underlying notice of violation, cessation order, or other order incorporated in a final decision issued by the Board, until abatement or compliance is achieved.

# R647-8-104. Procedure for Assessment of Individual Civil Penalty.

- 1. Notice. The Division will serve on each individual to be assessed an individual civil penalty a notice of proposed individual civil penalty assessment, including a narrative explanation of the reasons for the penalty, the amount to be assessed, and a copy of any underlying notice of violation and cessation order.
- 2. Final order and opportunity for review. The notice of proposed individual civil penalty assessment shall become a final order of the Division 30 days after service upon the individual unless:
- 2.11. The individual files within 30 days of service of the notice of proposed individual civil penalty assessment a petition for review with the Board; or
- 2.12. The Division and the individual or responsible corporate permittee or operator agree within 30 days of service of the notice of proposed individual civil penalty assessment to a schedule or plan for the abatement or correction of the violation, failure or refusal.
- 3. Service. Service of notice under R647-8-104 will satisfy the standard of R641, concerning the rules of practice and procedure before the Board.

### R647-8-105. Payment of Penalty.

- 1. No abatement or appeal. If a notice of proposed individual civil penalty assessment becomes a final order in the absence of a petition for review or abatement agreement, the penalty will be due upon issuance of the final order.
- 2. Appeal. If an individual named in a notice of proposed individual civil penalty assessment files a petition for review in accordance with R641, the penalty will be due upon issuance of a final Board order affirming, increasing, or decreasing the proposed penalty.
- 3. Abatement agreement. Where the Board and the corporate permittee, operator, or individual have agreed in writing on a plan for the abatement of or compliance with the unabated order, an individual named in a notice of proposed individual civil penalty assessment may postpone payment until receiving either a final order from the Board stating that the penalty is due on the date of such final order, or written notice that abatement or compliance is satisfactory and the penalty has been withdrawn.
- 4. Delinquent payment. Following the expiration of 30 days after the issuance of a final order assessing an individual civil penalty, any delinquent penalty will be subject to interest at the rate established quarterly by the U.S. Department of the Treasury for use in applying late charges on late payments to the Federal Government, pursuant to Treasury Financial Manual 6-8020.20. The Treasury current value of funds rate is published by the Fiscal Service in the notices section of the Federal Register. Interest on unpaid penalties will run from the date payment first was due until the date of payment. Failure to pay overdue penalties will result in referral to the Utah Attorney General for appropriate collection action.

**KEY:** minerals reclamation

2004

40-8-1 et seq.